The Honorable Benjamin H. Settle

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON AT TACOMA

EAGLE HARBOR HOLDINGS, LLC, and MEDIUSTECH, LLC,

Plaintiffs,

v.

FORD MOTOR COMPANY,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:11-cv-05503-BHS

FORD'S SUR-REPLY TO THE JOINT MOTION FOR DISCOVERY PURSUANT TO LCR 37 REGARDING FORD'S DOCUMENT PRODUCTION

NOTE ON MOTION CALENDAR: November 26, 2013

Plaintiffs attempt to justify their request for additional email discovery by asserting in their Reply that they "searched email from all their employees using 198 search terms and produced 53,216 emails and attachments." (Dkt. No. 187 at 24). Ford never asked Plaintiffs to search all of their employees' emails using nearly 200 search terms. Indeed, despite multiple previous requests for this information, Plaintiffs previously refused to identify which custodians they had collected emails from and what search terms they had used. (Leshan Decl. ¶ 10, Ex. I)¹

FORD'S SUR-REPLY TO THE JOINT MOTION FOR DISCOVERY PURSUANT TO LCR 37 REGARDING FORD'S DOCUMENT PRODUCTION - 1

No. 3:11-cv-05503-BHS

SAVITT BRUCE & WILLEY LLP 1425 Fourth Avenue Suite 800 Seattle, Washington 98101-2272 (206) 749-0500

232425

26

27

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

¹ Plaintiffs claim they provided information on this topic during the deposition of Mr. Brian Hewitt, but that deposition took place on November 19, 2013, *the same day Ford's opposition to Plaintiffs motion was due*. Ford had no meaningful opportunity to review or address this information, which Plaintiffs refused to provide during several earlier conferences with Ford on ESI discovery.

11

13

14

15

16 17

18

19

2021

22

2324

26

27

25

FORD'S SUR-REPLY TO THE JOINT MOTION FOR DISCOVERY PURSUANT TO LCR 37 REGARDING FORD'S DOCUMENT PRODUCTION - 2

No. 3:11-cv-05503-BHS

In any event, Plaintiffs' internal email collection process does not justify the email discovery they seek from Ford. Their claim that they "searched email from all their employees" masks the fact that Medius only has nine employees. (Ex. A (November 19, 2013 Deposition of Brian Hewitt at 213:17-25).) Moreover, regardless of how Plaintiffs chose to search their own ESI, this District's Model ESI Agreement and the Model Patent Order provide reasonable but fair default limits on how much ESI searching may be imposed on an adversary: five custodians, and five search terms each. Ford has agreed to search more than double these amounts. Plaintiffs' refusal to pay for additional searching of so-called "general" custodians using "general" terms shows that even they believe their requested searching is excessive.

For these reasons, as well as those stated in the parties' Joint Motion for Discovery Pursuant to LCR 37 (Dkt. No. 187), Ford respectfully requests that Plaintiffs' request be denied.

DATED: December 3, 2013

SAVITT BRUCE & WILLEY LLP

By: <u>/s/Duncan E. Manville</u>

Duncan E. Manville, WSBA #30304

Fax: (206) 749-0600

Email: dmanville@sbwllp.com

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP

Michael J. Summersgill (pro hac vice) Sarah Beigbeder Petty (pro hac vice) 60 State Street

Boston, Massachusetts 02109

Tel.: (617) 526-6000 Fax: (617) 526-5000

Email: michael.summersgill@wilmerhale.com

sarah.petty@wilmerhale.com

SAVITT BRUCE & WILLEY LLP 1425 Fourth Avenue Suite 800 Seattle, Washington 98101-2272 (206) 749-0500

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND DORR LLP Todd C. Zubler (pro hac vice) Grant K. Rowan (pro hac vice) 1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW Washington, D.C. 20006 Tel.: (202) 663-6636 Fax: (202)663-6363 Email: todd.zubler@wilmerhale.com grant.rowan@wilmerhale.com **BROOKS KUSHMAN P.C.** Frank A. Angileri (pro hac vice) John S. Le Roy (pro hac vice) 1000 Town Center, 22nd Floor Southfield, Michigan 48075 Tel.: (248) 358-4400 10 Fax: (248) 358-3351 Email: fangileri@brookskushman.com 11 jleroy@brookskushman.com 12 Attorneys for Defendant Ford Motor Company 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27

FORD'S SUR-REPLY TO THE JOINT MOTION FOR DISCOVERY PURSUANT TO LCR 37 REGARDING FORD'S DOCUMENT PRODUCTION - 3 No. 3:11-cv-05503-BHS

SAVITT BRUCE & WILLEY LLP 1425 Fourth Avenue Suite 800 Seattle, Washington 98101-2272 (206) 749-0500

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE I certify that this pleading was filed electronically with the Court and thus served simultaneously upon all counsel of record, this 3rd day of December, 2013. /s/ Duncan E. Manville Duncan E. Manville